



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
102 West 75th Street
September 25, 2007**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to install windows on this Renaissance/Romanesque Revival style apartment building designed by Gilbert A. Schellenger, built in 1891-92 and designated as part of the Upper West Side-Central Park West Historic District.

Removing the aluminum panning from eleven of the building's sixth floor arched "special" windows is a significant step towards restoring the integrity of 102 West 75th Street, a classic Columbus Avenue apartment house once known as the Del Monte. But this initial step does not, however, go far enough. The Landmarks Commission guidelines state that: "where the historic windows possess special architectural value, replacement windows shall match the material of the historic windows" and also stipulate that replacement windows in apartment houses of six or more stories match the "historic windows in terms of: configuration, operation, details, and finish." With this application, the window operation, the materials of the sash and the precedent for the brick mould should be reconsidered as they do not replicate the historic windows' design. We recommend that the Commission delay its decision until the crucial details for these elements can be provided.

Window Operation

Single-hung windows in a building that originally had double-hung, operable windows is completely inappropriate. This departure from architect Gilbert Schellenger's design for the building should not be permitted.

Window Materials and Brick Mould

The applicant is seeking approval on new metal replacement windows, and it would appear from the presentation that adequate information about dimensions and profiles of extant historic windows has not been provided for evaluation. The absence of important details raises the following questions: Is the historic brick mould still extant? What are the dimensions, profiles and details? What is the historic finish? All of this information is missing from the presentation materials and is crucial for their consideration. Additional documentation should be provided before the Commission moves forward to consider this application.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
293 Central Park West
September 25, 2007**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to install an awning and railing on this Renaissance Revival-style flats building designed by Neville and Bagge, built in 1895-96 and designated as part of the Upper West Side-Central Park West Historic District.

As part of this design concept, the applicant is clearly trying to refresh the street-level experience of this staid Neville & Bagge flats building on the Upper West Side's grand residential avenue. Perhaps as a nod to neighboring masterpieces like the El Dorado and the St. Urban, this design incorporates a new entrance awning and railing and flashier materials like glass and stainless steel to draw attention to the building's subterranean entrance.

Our committee does not object to the removal of the current cloth canopy and decorative concrete block areaway wall and are generally in favor of the concept for the proposed entrance awning as its below grade location renders it minimally visible from the street and sidewalk. Furthermore, its contemporary design incorporates metal and glass, both traditional elements for residential canopies. We also do not object to the minimalist design for the fence. The most egregious aspect of both proposals, however, was the decision to use stainless steel. In order to tone down the glitz, this material selection needs to be rethought for a more cohesive and contextual design.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
341-47 Amsterdam Avenue
September 25, 2007**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to legalize the installation of windows on this neo-Renaissance apartment building designed by Emery Roth, built in 1925 and designated as part of the Upper West Side-Central Park West Historic District.

It is our understanding from the applicant that the windows on this Emery Roth-designed apartment building were replaced without permits shortly after landmark designation in 1990. What a shame that the property owner skirted the landmarks process and removed the structure's original wood windows, a signature feature of its design. Specifically up for consideration are 12 arched "special" windows on the 15th floor, which constitute the crowning element of the building's more than 350 windows.

As part of this proposal, the metal chamfering that surrounds these 12 windows and simulates an "arched" effect will be removed and replaced with true arched sashes. This certainly is a positive step toward restoring the integrity of the building's original design. But it is unfortunate that an ersatz device like metal chamfering will be exchanged for another deceptive, simulated architectural effect: surface-applied muntins. As these windows are an important feature of 341-47 Amsterdam Avenue, the replacement sash should incorporate true divided lights, not an easily damaged and artificial looking appliqué.

Furthermore, it is not clear from the presentation what decisions have been made for the finish and paint color of the window replacements. Clearly, these details are critical for making a decision on this application.