

RESOLUTION

Date: March 4, 2008

Committee of Origin: Parks & Preservation

Re: 390 West End Avenue (West 79th Street.) Application #08-5082 for exterior renovations.

Full Board Vote: 27 In favor 0 Against 0 Abstentions 0 Present

In addition to the questions raised by Committee Members, Community Board 7/Manhattan Board Members and the general public, further research and a site visit by some members aided the drafting of this resolution. Our findings are as follows:

The Aphorp is one of a handful of early Twentieth century apartment houses and was at the time it was built in 1905 by Clinton & Russell, considered to be New York City's largest apartment building. Built on property acquired by William Backhouse Astor, John Jacob Astor's son, it is now considered as one of the most extraordinary and rare residential building type because of its architectural style, the spacious landscaped interior courtyard, use of limestone throughout all facades and the placement of ornamental sculptures over the primary entrances.

As a general comment, the presentation was confusing and many of the detailed drawings did not entirely support the verbal descriptions, containing insufficient information or missing larger-scale details entirely, including:

- Basic facts about the construction and modifications over time;
- Plans of the existing and proposed changes to the courtyard (only an annotated photograph was provided);
- The configuration of the original design of the courtyard plantings and design giving dimensions and notations where the original design had been altered, including a schedule of the times and numbers of cars accessing and using the space for loading and unloading to justify removal of a portion of the interior sidewalk;
- A detail describing the specification of the cut back granite paving in the courtyard;
- The design concept and requirement for two security booths;
- A suggested detail as to how the security boot would be installed against the existing masonry;
- A suggested detail as to how the gas piping would be installed to reach the new lamp posts and wall sconces;
- The details to support the removal of the 79th Street recess (bench) that appears to have been an opening to access the lower level/basement areaway.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7 / Manhattan **disapproves** the proposed design concepts.

Committee: 4-0-0-0. Board Members: 2-0-0-0.

250 West 87 Street New York, NY 10024-2706

Phone: (212) 362-4008 Fax: (212) 595-9317

Web site: www.cb7.org e-mail address: office@cb7.org

RESOLUTION

Date: March 4, 2008

Committee of Origin: Parks & Preservation

Re: 390 West End Avenue (West 79th Street.) Application #08-5204 for window replacement.

Full Board Vote: 27 In favor 0 Against 0 Abstentions 0 Present

The following facts and concerns were taken into account in arriving at our conclusion:

The window replacement program appeared impressive until the details of the proposal were examined and discussed. There seemed to be a general lack of understanding of the operation and detailing of the arched window sashes and their placement. Photographs showing deterioration were not specific, and in areas where there was noticeable deterioration and material loss, the applicant is proposing to abandon and conceal the deteriorated elements by panning over. From recollection, full elevations and existing conditions for the interior courtyard windows were not presented.

Using on-line source material and photographic archives, we were able to compile the following statistics:

- The arched windows exist on the main floor, 3rd, 10th and 12th floors. No reference was made to the setback penthouse at the roof level, we noted that these also have arched window openings.
- On the exterior above the third floor there are 84 windows per floor on the exterior perimeter. This accounts for a total of 920 windows on floors 3 -12, of which 252 or 27% are arched.
- Further study and review of the existing window configuration and construction indicate that these are arched glass panes set into a square frame with the corners above the glass filled in with solid wood. This gives the appearance of an arched top sash against the stone archway opening, but is in fact square and part of the interior framing and decoration of the window when viewed from the inside.
- The window configuration of both 1/1 and 2/2 vertical mullioned double hung sashes and their placement on the four exterior façades and the interior courtyard was not clearly presented, only theories as to why each façade had a different patterning.

The Parks & Preservation Committee recognizes that at present, the building is tenanted and cost of replication may be an issue. We do not believe the increases in a wood replacement are as high as presented at the Committee Meeting by the applicant and this option should be explored further. We also do not believe that replicating only the exterior corner casement windows in wood, and panning over and replacing all of the other windows in aluminum is aesthetically appropriate or feasible, as the curved elements of the double hung sash will look very different from the original design and appearance.

The Parks & Preservation Committee was unable approve this part of the application as presented, primarily because of both missing and misleading information. We urge the Landmark Commission to revisit the special configuration of the windows, their placement in the facade and the visibility of this historic building whose elevations are clearly visible on three sides as a result of the broad avenues and cross street where it is located. We strongly recommend that wood repairs and replacement in kind will be essential to maintaining the character and detail of the building. The same care and attention taken to determining the earlier paint color should be applied to the technology selected for the repairs and replication.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7 / Manhattan **disapproves** of the proposed window replacement program using a combination of wood windows for the corner casements and aluminum replication with aluminum panning over the window sills for the remainder of the windows.

Committee: 3-1-0-0. Board Members: 2-0-0-0.

250 West 87 Street New York, NY 10024-2706

Phone: (212) 362-4008 Fax: (212) 595-9317

Web site: www.cb7.org e-mail address: office@cb7.org