

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
Regarding 250 West 77th Street - Hotel Belleclaire
March 23, 2004**

LANDMARK WEST! is a non-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to replace windows on all of the secondary elevations.

While the Committee recognizes the effort made to conform to the original configuration of these distinct and crucial windows, the proposed windows do not match the profile, material, or intricate mullion detailing of the original. This proposal calls for the wholesale removal of a significant amount of the Belleclaire's original historic fabric and the Committee urges the Commission to deny this application.

The Hotel Belleclaire, built in 1901-03, was one of Emery Roth's first buildings. Roth would go on to design some 200 buildings in New York City and would play an especially important role in shaping the skyline of the Upper West Side. In designing this building, Roth combined Beaux Arts principles with his own Art Nouveau_Secessionist style, giving the building its distinctive ornate surface ornamentation and window treatment. In his book, *Mansions in the Clouds*, architectural historian Steven Rutenbaum compares the "flamboyant image" and "bold, three-dimensional" quality of the Belleclaire to the Ansonia, built at the same time just four blocks south on Broadway. Christopher Gray, columnist for the *New York Times*, emphasizes "the asymmetrical windowpanes, twelve in the top sash, three in the bottom," as one of the defining features of the building.

The Belleclaire suffered years of neglect and is in need of significant restoration. One of the advantages, however, of years of neglect is that the Belleclaire has *almost all* of its original Emery Roth wood windows - unlike other New York City landmark apartment buildings that suffer from a hodge-podge of mismatched windows installed prior to designation. In this case, it is particularly important that the Commission closely scrutinize whether the original windows are, indeed, deteriorated beyond repair or whether they are capable of being restored. If the windows must be replaced, they must be replaced in kind. The proposed substitute is unacceptable.

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
Regarding 52 West 84th Street
March 23, 2004**

LANDMARK WEST! is a non-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to alter a window opening at the basement level.

The basement ventilation opening is a historic feature that is typical - and remains intact - on many rowhouses in the Upper West Side / Central Park West Historic District. The Committee does not feel that the removal of this feature is appropriate.