



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
159 West 82nd Street
February 12, 2008**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to legalize façade work performed without Landmarks Preservation Commission permits on this Queen Anne-style rowhouse built in 1885, designed by William Baker and designated as part of the Upper West Side-Central Park West Historic District.

We would like to commend the Commission for enforcing this violation of the landmarks guidelines. It is essential to the success of the Landmarks Law that the Commission be diligent in reversing illegal work and enforcing appropriate work with permits.

This intact row of six houses is one of the gems of this block and features an interesting play between stone and brick masonry. As great admirers of this row, we feel that the work presented today is not headed in the right direction. The tax photo from the late 1930s shows that the base of this structure was uncoated brownstone. Yet over the intervening 70 years, the base of each of the six rowhouses was treated with white paint or stucco. Although the white base is consistent throughout the row, we feel it is ill-advised to perpetuate this later, inappropriate condition, as proposed in this application. We recommend that the applicant remove the white stucco from the base of the structure and resurface the brownstone replicating the original brownstone color and original rustication and restore the soldier coursing below the second floor bay to its original appearance. This will set the tone for other property owners to follow as well.

We look forward to the successful restoration of this building.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
101 West 81st Street
February 12, 2008**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to construct a rooftop addition of this Romanesque Revival-style hotel building designed by Edward L. Angell, built in 1889-91 and designated as part of the Upper West Side-Central Park West Historic District.

Since 1997, our committee has presented statements on 9 rooftop additions at this property, all but one of which were ultimately approved by the Commission. In each statement, we have advocated for a rooftop addition master plan and have been informed by Commission legal counsel that this is not possible. Absent such a plan, which the Commission's legal counsel has informed us is impossible even though the Commission regularly approves master plans for other modifications such as windows, the accumulated mass that has developed on top of 101 West 81st Street runs totally against the landmarks guidelines, which cite the following characteristics as significant when designing additions:

“does not result in damage to, or demolition of, a significant architectural feature of the roof of the structure on which the rooftop addition is to be constructed”; “is either not visible from a public thoroughfare or is only minimally visible” and “does not adversely affect significant architectural features of adjacent improvements”.

While some of the individual additions may have been determined as “minimally visible” under the guidelines, taken as a whole, the entire complex is most visible from the street and from the heavily-trafficked Theodore Roosevelt Park, a premier, landmarked public space in the neighborhood.

In the discussion of each proposal, the Commission, applicants and public have deliberated about materials, window sizes and roof heights. But the real issue at hand is that the Commission has incrementally permitted what amounts to an additional half-story on this architecturally significant Romanesque-Revival structure, which was designed to rival The Dakota. So we ask the Commission to consider this question: If one applicant had put forward one proposal for a rooftop extension with this hodge-podge design, would it have been deemed acceptable for a Certificate of Appropriateness? We think not.

LANDMARK WEST!

THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

This application should be denied in order to end the incremental and inappropriate development of the Hotel Endicott's roof. Not only is this structure highly visible from public rights-of-way, it is also a protected structure under the Landmarks Law.

The architectural assault that has occurred on this building's rooftop should guide the Commission in considering rooftop additions on other large apartment buildings. Else other buildings resemble the "prairie dog mall" sprouting from Edward Angell's Hotel Endicott, master plans should be mandated by the Commission.