



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
65 Central Park West
February 26, 2008**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to alter masonry openings and install windows and doors on this neo-Renaissance-style apartment building designed by Emery Roth and built in 1927.

When a similar application was reviewed by the Commission on March 21, 2006, LANDMARK WEST! did not object based on the following criteria:

- 1) The penthouse is not original to the building.
- 2) The windows and doors are minimally visible from Central Park and other public rights-of-way.

We have evaluated the finished product on this Central Park West Emery Roth building and still consider this project permissible. And so, we feel confident this project will not undermine the historic structure, the historic district or the view from the Central Park scenic landmark.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
70 West 71st Street
February 26, 2008**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to construct a rear yard addition on this neo-Grec style rowhouse designed by Christian Blinn and built in 1878.

We are not opposed to this application as the building is near the corner of Columbus Avenue and consequently is not contiguous with the rear yard “doughnut” of open space in the mid-block.

As a general matter, our committee is deeply concerned about the impact of rearyard additions on the footprint of historic rowhouse blocks, in both architectural and environmental terms. We are not opposed to this particular application as the building is near the corner of Columbus Avenue and consequently is not contiguous with the rear yard “doughnut” of open space in the mid-block, and thus part of the interior “oasis” that is an important aspect of these blocks’ significance.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
Claremont Stables
175-177 West 89th Street
February 26, 2008**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to amend Certificate of Appropriateness 93-0030 for the construction of a one-story penthouse addition for this Romanesque Revival-style carriage house and stable designed by Frank A. Rooke and built in 1892.

We would like to begin with a moment of silence for the Claremont Riding Academy, which until it closed in 2006, was the oldest functioning commercial stable in New York. Not only do we miss the clopping sounds of hoofbeats on West 89th Street, but the absence of horses in Central Park calls the future of its bridle paths into question.

That being said, our committee does not oppose the concept of a rooftop addition on this individual landmark, but recommends that certain details be revisited before moving forward with the proposal. Those details include the proposed pitched roofs behind the stable's parapet wall and the materials of the addition.

False Gables

One of the building's idiosyncratic quirks is the prominent gables on either side of its primary façade. The 1990 designation report identifies this feature as well, stating "these end pavilions rise to gabled roofs while the rest of the roof is flat". When viewed from the side, it becomes evident that the "gables" are, in fact, false, two-dimensional extensions of the parapet wall. Currently, the void behind the gables is cast in shadow, adding to the drama of gables. And this effect is carried over to the three neighboring carriage houses (at 167-171 West 89th Street) which also were designed by Frank Rooke as part of the same development. Filling in the rear of the gables with a pitched roof, as the application proposes, would eliminate this shadow and eliminate what one Committee member called the "oddity" of this building. Further, it would diminish its relationship with the three smaller complementary buildings. Creating a greater separation between the primary parapet wall and the proposed penthouse would preserve the distinctive profile of the gables—and the illusion called out in the designation report—more effectively distinguishing the old and the new.

Materials

As we have stated to this Commission before, we are more supportive of additions incorporating metal cladding and glass to let them declare themselves as modern elements

LANDMARK WEST!

THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

and to distinguish between building campaigns. We are not in favor of the neutral stucco proposed for the penthouse's surface and ask the applicant to consider a lighter cladding material, such as standing seam metal, to help distinguish the old and the new.

We close by calling attention to Rooke's three neighboring carriage houses—the longtime home of Ballet Hispanico—for which the Commission held a public hearing in 1988 but has never designated. As stated, the carriage houses and Claremont Stables were constructed in one building scheme and are among the surviving remnants of West 89th Street's stable district, a street had seven stables in 1902, according to the designation report. We urge the Commission to take final action on the process that began in 1988, and move swiftly to protect these structures. Recent history has illustrated that former stables and carriage houses are an endangered species on the Upper West Side.

Enclosed, please find a Request for Evaluation for 167-171 West 89th Street.