



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
175 West 73rd Street
September 26, 2006**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to establish a Master Plan governing the future replacement of storefronts on this neo-Renaissance-style apartment building designed by Herbert M. Sohn and built in 1925 in the Central Park West-Upper West Side historic district.

Again, we thank the applicant for presenting this proposal to our committee. The storefronts at The Verdi, 175 West 73rd Street, have long been a blight visible from Upper West Side's treasured Verdi Square, and we applaud the Commission and applicant team for moving forward with a masterplan to organize this façade. We are generally in favor of this application, but have reservations about two elements of the signage: the magnificent P&G Bar and Café neon sign and the mounting mechanism for panelized signs on the storefront.

P&G Sign: Since the early 1940s, the iconic P&G sign has graced the southeast corner of this neo-Renaissance building and added vibrancy to a heavily-trafficked part of the neighborhood. This masterful Art Deco addition is part of the historical decorative layering of the structure and should be preserved as an important element of the façade. This application before you includes a proposal to replace the neon sign in the event that P&G should close or relocate. According to Manhattan Community Board 7, the bar's relocation is a real possibility, and we ask the commission to recognize the sign's significance to the historic district. Replacement signs for subsequent businesses at this location should recall the neon material and Art Deco design of the original P&G sign.

Storefront signage: The other concern with the application is the uniformity and flatness of the proposed panelized signage. As the Art Deco P&G sign so brilliantly exemplifies, signage is a vernacular element of storefronts and, even in a historic district, should be allowed a reasonable amount of individual expression. As presented, the sign panels and script in this proposal are overly standardized, and also obscure part of the building's limestone storefront. For a more appropriate execution on a similar building, we refer the applicant and Commission to the recently restored storefronts at the Cornwall (a non-landmarked building at Broadway and West 90th Street that is on the LANDMARK WEST! "wishlist") where the building's signage is mounted from below and does not obscure architectural details.

LANDMARK WEST!

THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

In conclusion, we will be in favor of this application after the signage issues have been addressed.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
175 West 73rd Street
September 26, 2006**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to establish a Master Plan governing the future replacement of windows on this neo-Renaissance-style apartment building designed by Herbert M. Sohn and built in 1925 in the Central Park West-Upper West Side Historic District.

We would like to begin by thanking David Acheson and Kate Griep of Acheson Doyle Architects for their very thorough presentation of this proposal to our committee. Unfortunately, we cannot testify in favor of this application. Any windows masterplan approved for this building should allow for preservation of the building's only remaining original windows in the elevator shaft and should recall the original material and 8-over-1 configuration of lights for replacement windows. The proposed in-kind replacement of 1-over-1 aluminum windows perpetuates an unfortunate problem. The current windows were installed in the 1980s, before the building was landmarked. This application represents an opportunity to return the building to a more appropriate condition with wood sash, 8-over-1 windows.

As we have stated before this Commission many times and as the commissioners themselves reiterated during the September 12, 2006 discussion of the window masterplan for 275 Central Park West, windows are an often overlooked but highly significant factor in the visual character of a building.

We urge you to deny this application.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
73 West 68th Street
September 26, 2006**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to excavate the rear yard and construct a rear yard addition at this Renaissance Revival-style rowhouse designed by Edward Kilpatrick and built in 1893-94 in the Central Park West-Upper West Side historic district.

After being listed as “laid over” for over a week, this application reappeared on the Commission agenda the afternoon of Friday, September 22. This short notice did not allow adequate time for public review. We do not object to this application based on the information provided in the proposed plan and elevation, but the absence of “existing conditions” photographs as well as material samples for the French doors and greenhouse make this proposal impossible to evaluate.



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
El Dorado Apartment Building
300-306 Central Park West
September 26, 2006**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on application to construct an addition at this Art Deco-style residential building, an individual landmark in the Upper West Side-Central Park West historic district, designed by Margon and Holder with Emery Roth as consultant and constructed in 1929.

Due to the grandfathered status of this addition, our committee does not object to this application. As presented, the proposal is benign and minimally visible and does not appear to be a detriment to the historic district or views of the El Dorado from West 91st and West 92nd Street. That being said, we do not extend blanket support to additional construction on the grand terraces of this individual landmark. Having been preceded by an earlier shed, this addition's grandfathered status is a special circumstance and certainly should not be considered a precedent for further accretions on this Art Deco masterpiece.