Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
48-50 West 69th Street
August 2, 2016

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on the application to amend an approval for the construction of rooftop additions; reconstruction and redesign of rear facades; modification of front areaways and a portion of one of the facades; installation of windows; and excavations at 48-50 West 69th Street. Located within the Upper West Side/Central Park West Historic District, these row houses were built in 1892-93 and designed by Gilbert A. Schellenger in the Renaissance Revival Style.

The LANDMARK WEST! Certificate of Appropriateness Committee is pleased to see the Applicant's plans to restore some of the details of #50, particularly the cornice. Additionally, the committee accepts the increased height on the rooftop addition, as it remains setback from the street. Despite this, many of the issues raised in the committee’s review of the client’s original application in 2014 remain unaddressed.

In 2014, the CoA committee stated that it could not “condone the proposal for the new Juliette balcony” and urged the applicant to respectfully restore the original stoop at #50. The combination of houses #48 and #50 is contrary to the original design and intent of the architecture. The reintroduction of the stoop would minimize the impression that this combination leaves on the streetscape, maintaining the unified appearance of “high stoops and the earth tones of brick and brownstone facades” cited as significant in the 1990 designation of the Upper West Side/Central Park West Historic District.

The same issues arise on the rear elevation of the building. The committee supports the reintroduction of red brick on the rear yard façade of #50. However, the alteration of the top story fenestration on the pair leaves no indication that these two buildings were once separate structures. While the proposed multi-story arched windows on both houses give more of an impression of an outdoor ballroom than a backyard on the Upper West Side, the negative effects of these alterations can be counteracted by maintaining the original size and arrangement of the top story windows.

Ultimately, while the CoA committee approves of the owner’s attempt to restore elements of this pair of row houses, it sees the failure to reintroduce the stoop at #50 as a missed opportunity to revisit the original design intent and to maintain the streetscape. It is unfortunate that the client is spending money on extra muntins and detailing on the
backyard windows while neglecting to restore a key component of these houses’ original appearance.

The LANDMARK WEST! Certificate of Appropriateness Committee asks the LPC to revisit the alterations accepted in the original Certificate of Approval.

Thank you for your time.