

THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

## Testimony of LANDMARK WEST! Certificate of Appropriateness Committee Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission 7 West 92<sup>nd</sup> Street October 27, 2015

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on 7 West 92<sup>nd</sup> Street, aka The Raleigh, a Flats building designed by Gilbert A. Schellenger in the Renaissance Revival Style and built in 1889-90. The application is to install new windows.

The Committee finds the proposed application inappropriate.

The Applicant is proposing to replace originally curved primary façade wood windows with aluminum-clad flat replacements. Aside from the disruption of materials and finish, the new windows would continue to facet and fracture a more sinuous façade that has suffered under previous inappropriate replacements. It appears as though no investment in windows has been made in the quarter century that this building has been designated a landmark and thus this is the right time to restore the original windows or, if absolutely necessary, replace the curved windows in kind, or at the very least, set a master plan to do so.

Beyond base aesthetics, there is a practical reason for replacement in kind. Forcing a flat surface into a rounded bay yields less light for the inhabitants, as there is less surface area of glass. It also exposes open head and sill conditions that were not meant to be open to the elements. Insetting a flat window as proposed will leave a gap in the sill. This can be mitigated by either lapping a secondary sill to the exterior –further altering the public presence or by sistering in a sill and creating a seam- an option that requires more effort and skill but a prospect which may open the possibility for infiltration of the elements into the wall cavity, further jeopardizing the landmark. The Applicant is proposing to lap an additional element, one that in their drawings conflicts with perimeter wood trim, and changes exterior appearance. Why replace original wood trim, and alter stone sills to suit an ill-fitting proposal of lesser material quality and finish than this building deserves?

Further, drawing SK-B for Window Type B shows a wood header. Clearly this is not original as it would never have protruded as far. Thus in order to accommodate the altered, inferior design, further original elements are being lost. Sash, trim, sill–what is left?

The new windows do not retain their original design.

The new windows seek to alter original decorative moldings.

The new windows seek to alter original sills.

The new windows are not made of the same material as the original window or even one similar.

The new windows proposed are integrally colored and cannot be painted or stained in a manner similar to that of the historic windows.

This Application should be denied.