



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
103 West 72nd Street
September 14, 2021**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on 103 West 72nd Street, an Art Deco style apartment and commercial building within the Upper West Side/Central Park West Historic District. This landmark was designed by Fellheimer & Wagner and built in 1931-33. The application is to replace storefront infill and construct a rear yard addition.

The Landmark West Certificate of Appropriateness Committee is excited to see Malachy's Donegal Inn not only surviving but also thriving during these difficult times and we wholeheartedly support its northward expansion with a rear yard addition. While the lot coverage and scale are appropriate for a commercial first floor, we echo the concerns of others in the community about the stucco cladding and believe that brick walls would reduce future maintenance impacts on neighbors.

Regarding the storefront, we are eager to see this building return to its intended façade. Replicating the original door is fantastic. But why then, refashion the hopper windows as blind panels, especially when removing obstructions as shown in section? We would also prefer a retractable awning, which is more common to the commercial corridor, and original to this building as shown in the historic photos. The included context photos exhibit no projecting fixed frame awnings in any of the neighboring commercial spaces.

While trying not to dampen our enthusiasm, we do have two wishes. First, this façade is unlikely to receive another makeover of this caliber for decades. We would ask the client and commission seriously consider replacement of the missing liver-veined marble panel of the storefront enframingent. Second, with such a seemingly simple façade, any deviation is more strongly perceived. The original composition had a triumphal central one and one-half bay high window, which emphasized the storefront, informed the second story mullion benchmarks and evoked a stepping motif so signature to the style. By assimilating the central second story panels into the surround of that floor, this reading is lost and the minimal storefront is suppressed--pushed down to the street, rather than offering the uplifting moment that raised one's eye and let this little building stand among its neighbors like George and Edward Blum's domineering Churrigueresque apartment house due west. At the very least we would suggest a different treatment for those central second tier panels.

We are truly happy to support this proposal, and feel that these slight modifications can meet modern needs and still honor the building.

Thank You.